

**CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH
PARKING AND PUBLIC IMPROVEMENTS COMMISSION
MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING
September 26, 2019**

A. CALL TO ORDER:

The regular meeting of the Parking and Public Improvements Commission of the City of Manhattan Beach, California was held on September 26, 2019 at the hour of 6:00p.m., in the City Council Chambers, at 1400 Highland Avenue, in said City.

B. PLEDGE TO FLAG

C. ROLL CALL

Present: Commissioners Murillo, Franklin, Delk, and Chair Longhurst
Absent: Commissioner Paralusz
Staff Present: Traffic Engineer Erik Zandvliet, Utilities Division Manager Shawn Igoe, Acting Revenue Services Manager Cynthia Mickschl, Public Works Director Stephanie Katsouleas
Clerks: Fel Cortez

D. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

09/26/19-1. Regular Meeting - July 25, 2019

MOTION: It was moved and seconded (**Delk/Murillo**) to approve the minutes with no changes.

AYES: Murillo, Franklin, Delk, and Chair Longhurst
NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None
ABSENT: Paralusz

E. AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (3-minute Limit)

Chair Longhurst opened Audience Participation (3-minute Limit).

David Gentry, who lives on Manzanita Lane, raised issues concerning the southbound traffic flow on Redondo Avenue at Marine Avenue. Mr. Gentry stated that the volume of cars going across the intersection is alarming; about one in every three cars goes straight across illegally. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** stated he would contact the Police Department for enforcement.

Erica Nutting, who lives at the intersection of 18th Street and Pacific Avenue, raised concerns about this intersection and safety of the children crossing there. **Ms. Nutting** stated it is one of the only intersections along Pacific Avenue in the immediate area that does not have a stop sign.

Rene Ascencio, of 413 S. Aviation Boulevard, had concerns about traffic speeds adjacent to his home on Aviation Boulevard. Mr. Ascencio stated there are too many accidents in that area and identified the intersection of 2nd Street and Artesia Boulevard as an example. **Commissioner Franklin** asked if Mr. Ascencio's driveway lead out to Aviation Blvd. **Mr. Ascencio** confirmed. **Chairperson Longhurst** thanked Mr. Ascencio for his concerns and stated that Traffic Engineer Zandvliet would look into calming measures for that area.

Chairperson Longhurst closed Audience Participation.

F. GENERAL BUSINESS

09/26/19-2. West Marine Avenue Neighborhood Traffic Management Plan Second Follow-Up Study

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet summarized the staff report and stated that this item was a second follow up study. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** stated the PPIC (Parking and Public Improvements Commission) Commissioners recommended "about" 9 different traffic calming measures in September 2017, which were later approved by the City Council. This item was returned to the PPIC a year later with follow-up study/results, which showed the results of the measures to be favorable. At the October 2018 PPIC

meeting, additional measures were recommended and later approved at the December 2018 City Council meeting. Most measures, at this point, have been installed. After another follow-up study with additional speed and volume counts in 2019, there was a traffic volume reduction of between 14 and 25% on Marine Avenue between the studies. Speeds did not change, but excessive speeding was not evident. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** stated that no new measures are recommended at this time. City Council also wanted staff to look into mini traffic circles as a traffic calming measure in lieu of stop signs.

Commissioner Murillo asked about the feasibility of the traffic circles and stated that installation in areas where there is no curb and gutter could be invasive to the neighbors' property lines. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** concurred and stated that other traffic calming measures would be pursued before considering mini traffic circles, but that the intersection of Pacific Avenue and 18th Street could be a possible test site.

Commissioner Franklin asked where the conceptual traffic circle was proposed. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** responded the intersection of Flournoy Road and 27th Street. **Commissioner Franklin** asked if the second study had been done exactly as the previous study. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** confirmed that the follow-up studies were done at the same locations using the same counters. **Commissioner Franklin** stated that he liked the idea of trying traffic circles but not in an area close to a school zone.

Commissioner Murillo stated that he did not see a cost included for possible litigation by the homeowners. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** responded that mini traffic circles are considered roadway features, and if they're designed properly, then there would be design immunity on the part of the city.

Commissioner Franklin asked what caused the double-digit volume reductions and wanted a further explanation about sharrows. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** responded that with any new feature/changes, there is a learning curve and that information is sent out to help educate the public on these changes. **Commissioner Franklin** asked follow up questions pertaining to the reduction of traffic in the area and truck routes. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** responded the reduction is due to the City requirement that contractors follow Construction Management and Parking Plans (CMPP) which limit the amount of construction related vehicles in the city and requires contractors/delivery trucks to take the shortest route to their destinations.

Chairperson Longhurst opened the floor for the **Public Hearing**.

Mike Bohannon, of 649 Marine Avenue, said he initiated this item back in 2016. **Mr. Bohannon** asked how many days the test was done and the volume of traffic was. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** responded the counts were taken for two days each time, and handed Mr. Bohannon a document detailing the daily volumes. **Mr. Bohannon** responded to the volumes and stated that homeowners have a tendency to travel around 15 mph and that he was not sure that the volume of about 3,300 cars was mostly people who live on the street in question. He considers Marine Avenue to be like a freeway and acts as a main thoroughfare to the beach. **Mr. Bohannon** stated he would assume the responsibility for gathering signatures for a petition on this matter and requested a stop sign at the intersection of Flournoy Road and Marine Avenue. He further stated that he would like to have a permanent electronic speed awareness sign installed, which he stated helps reduce speeds by 80% and that the city should consider reducing speeds where there are no sidewalks. In addition, he felt that speeds on this local street should be dropped to 20 mph.

Commissioner Murillo asked if the current speeds are set at 25 mph. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** responded that the 25 mph speed is a prima faciae speed limit set by federal/state law for all local streets. It would not be enforceable to lower speed limits to 20 mph because the general public drives within a reasonable driving speed of 25mph. The majority of drivers drive according to the conditions that they see, not by what the speed limit sign says.

Chairperson Longhurst closed the **Public Hearing** and opened **Commissioner Discussion**.

Commissioner Murillo questioned why there are speed signs at all if people drive the way they want to drive. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** responded that speed limits are set by the prevailing traffic on the street and prima faciae speed limits, which on local streets is 25 mph. Signs are posted as a reminder to the general public not to exceed the reasonable speed, or the speed set by an Engineering Study as the safe speed.

Discussion followed concerning the challenge of slowing traffic on steeper hills as well as other residential areas in the city. The Commissioners felt that intersections in these areas were worse before crosswalks were installed.

Commissioner Delk stated that adding more police presence during certain times where speeding generally occurs would help deter the speeding issue. This would require some enforcement on the part of the Police Department. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** stated that passive measures, such as a parked police car, could also be put in place to help deter speeding.

MOTION: It was moved and seconded (**Delk/Murillo**) to recommend no further traffic calming measures be implemented and to continue existing traffic calming measures as approved by City Council on November 7, 2017 and December 18, 2018. The Commission also recommended speeding and moving violations should continue to be targeted by the Police Department.

AYES:	Murillo, Franklin, Delk, and Chair Longhurst
NOES:	None
ABSTAIN:	None
ABSENT:	Paralusz

09/26/19-3. Discussion of the Citywide Crosswalk Enhancement Evaluation

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet summarized the staff report and stated that the purpose was to compile and prioritize a list of previously requested pedestrian improvements in conjunction with recommendations from the Downtown Specific Plan and Mobility Plan. At the May 30, 2017 City Council Meeting, staff was given direction to examine crosswalk enhancement opportunities and incorporate them into planned CIP projects. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** commented that many improvements have been completed over the past two years. The methodology used to evaluate the priority locations took into consideration certain policies and general standard professional practices to determine a valued criteria. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** stated that the current list contains about 38 different locations throughout the city, which can be added on to later, if necessary. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** brought attention to Exhibit 10 of the staff report. The Mobility Plan and Crosswalk Evaluation Study improves the chances to obtain grant funding for crossing projects. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** brought attention to Exhibit 8 of the staff report that shows the location of current crossing enhancements.

Commissioner Murillo asked if there had been a pedestrian/traffic study done for crossings along Highland Avenue. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** stated that traffic volumes were done along Highland Avenue in the El Porto area, but no pedestrian counts have been done. **Commissioner Murillo** brought attention to the \$150,000 cost for improvements at this intersection and questioned if the existing pedestrian traffic justifies the expense. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** responded that there was no pedestrian volume criteria included, which was intentional because pedestrian improvements increase pedestrian volumes. **Commissioner Murillo** stated he would like to see in-pavement lights added to 12th Street and Highland Avenue.

Commissioner Franklin asked about ongoing maintenance costs and if a column could be added to the exhibit. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** responded that when infrastructure is built, it must be maintained and is a City responsibility. **Commissioner Franklin** stated that the current exhibit does not include ongoing maintenance costs, but it could be added.

Commissioner Murillo asked about the budget for the improvements. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** stated there was no budget yet and would be decided by the City Council.

Chairperson Longhurst opened the **Public Hearing**.

Matthew LeGrand, of 404 20th Street, stated that recent improvements have been “awesome”. Mr. LeGrand voiced his support for the upgrades and is comfortable with Staff recommendations. He additionally stated that Manhattan Beach is the first city in which he has lived where the crosswalk buttons actually work.

Rene Ascencio asked why there was nothing on the improvements list for Aviation Boulevard. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** responded that there was a separate corridor study concentrating only on Aviation Boulevard improvements included in the Draft Living Streets Manual, which would be going to the City Council soon.

Dr. Katie Massoudian, of 616 19th Street, brought attention to 19th Street and Ardmore Avenue. **Dr. Massoudian** said there is a stairwell that leads down to the Greenbelt which has a lot of traffic and crossing pedestrians. She further stated that the list included no metric for stop sign violations and that this intersection has a stop violation rate and a past fatality. **Dr. Massoudian** stated that a flashing stop sign or pedestrian activated light should be considered. **Commissioner Franklin** asked if there was enough of a landing at the top of the stairwell. **Dr. Massoudian** stated that the landing was about 4' x 3'. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** stated that an enhancement to the stop sign and not the crosswalk would be appropriate and could save on costs.

Joan Gosser of 1720 N. Poinsettia Avenue voiced issues concerning the 18th Street and Pacific Avenue intersection. **Ms. Gosser** stated that the intersection is one of three locations on a primary school route that has poor driver/pedestrian visibility. **Ms. Gosser** stated her issue is that there are stop signs at every intersection except for 18th Street and Pacific Avenue, and that the intersection needs a stop sign or crossing guard.

Commissioner Franklin asked if there are a lot of parents walking their kids to school. **Ms. Gosser** affirmed there are.

Discussion followed concerning traffic circles and their configuration and application. It was noted that traffic circles used in lieu of stop signs can calm traffic, which results in lower overall traffic speeds.

Ms. Gosser stated that a traffic circle near a school is a dangerous proposition and reiterated that she believes the intersection needs a stop sign or crossing guard.

Chairperson Longhurst closed **Public Hearing**.

Commissioner Franklin stated that funding is always an issue and asked if these things can be part of a grant application. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** confirmed that there are specific grants available for the proposed improvements.

Commissioner Murillo asked if there is any way to incorporate pedestrian traffic in the report. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** responded that it would take time. Staff could make some rough estimates and educated guesses for future pedestrian traffic, or the pedestrian study could be done in phases.

Commissioner Delk stated he likes the idea of roundabouts, but not in a residential area where there are a lot of pedestrians. Ultimately, he didn't feel that roundabouts fit well in Manhattan Beach. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** responded that there is a difference between large roundabouts that replace traffic signals and small circles that redirect traffic in a residential area.

Chairperson Longhurst asked for clarification if staff was looking for recommendations on how to prioritize the list of projects or moving it on to City Council. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** stated that staff is looking for recommendations to forward to City Council, how it should be added into the CIP, and how to prioritize the locations.

Commission Franklin recommended the Joslyn Center crosswalks and the 19th Street and Ardmore Avenue intersection as priority areas.

Chairperson Longhurst stated that the Commission should look into the need for phasing in improvements rather than adding expensive projects into the CIP and that some interim safety measures could be done.

There was **no motion** made.

09/26/19-4. Consider Approving Various Paid Parking Measures on Parkview Avenue between Village Drive and the Manhattan Beach Studios, and on Village Drive Between Parkview Avenue and Rosecrans Avenue

Utilities Division Manager, Shawn Igoe summarized the staff report stating the need for parking meter installation/reinstallation, implementing parking permit programs, and providing a CIP construction lay-down area along Parkview Avenue and Village Drive. A supplemental PowerPoint presentation was provided as a visual aid. **Shawn Igoe** provided background information on the history of parking meters that were installed in the area and later removed due to the low revenue generated. On April 16, 2019, City Council directed staff to look into reinstalling a number of the meters. **Shawn Igoe** stated that reinstallation would be very expensive and provided the material costs and possible locations for the reinstalled meters, some of which would require tree removal, sidewalk, and landscaping improvements as well as ADA required improvements. A parking permit program could be implemented on Parkview Avenue, which would provide additional overflow parking for the Manhattan Beach Studios as well as acting as a CIP construction lay-down area; this would limit the impact of on residents and businesses in the area. **Shawn Igoe** stated his recommendations to the Commission.

Commissioner Franklin asked if reinstalled meters would be in effect from 9:00am – 5:00pm. **Shawn Igoe** responded yes.

Commissioner Murillo asked what would be the projected recapture period for the investment. **Shawn Igoe** responded that if projected revenue averages \$81.00 per meter per month, the recapture period would be about 20 months. **Commissioner Murillo** stated that since labor costs were not included in the report and could potentially double the overall cost, which would extend the recapture period to about 40 months.

Commissioner Delk asked when the original study was made to determine the meter revenues. **Shawn Igoe** responded the study was done in 2012, around the time the meters were removed. He further stated that a number of the meters were not used for more than 30 days.

Commissioner Longhurst asked about the parking pass program and whether it would be primarily for the Manhattan Beach Studios. **Shawn Igoe** concurred. **Commissioner Longhurst** further asked if the construction lay-down area and the parking permit program would be one side or the other. **Shawn Igoe** responded that the construction lay-down area would be along the south side of the street while revenue could be generated with the parking permit program along the north side or both sides.

Commissioner Murillo asked about the hourly meter rate amount when study was done. **Shawn Igoe** stated that he did not know what the rates were at the time. **Acting Revenue Services Manager Cynthia Mickschl** responded that the rates were at \$1.00 per hour and are now at \$1.75 per hour (*actual rates were \$1.25 per hour, clarified later by Cynthia Mickschl).

Commissioner Franklin asked if businesses were surveyed about the proposal. **Shawn Igoe** responded no. **Commissioner Franklin** stated that this could impact the employees and the morale for the businesses.

Commissioner Murillo stated that the Commissioners would need better estimates on projection of use and parking volume to make a more informed decision on the investment. **Director of Public Works, Stephanie Katsouleas** responded that the question was not one that staff could answer at this time. Not enough revenue was produced from the parking meters to cover the cost for installation due to nearby free mall parking. The area near the hotel could generate more revenue due to higher hotel parking rates, which is why staff is recommending the 29 meters be reinstalled in this area. **Director Katsouleas** further expounded on details of the staff report stating that phasing in a few meters at a time could also be a viable method.

Commissioner Murillo stated he was on the fence on the recommendations and that the Commissioners did not have enough data available to make a decision but did concur that phasing in a few meters at a time could work.

Commissioner Franklin stated that any changes should encourage visitors to the hotel. Paid parking could be a significant bump in cost and a lot of money to invest with an unknown return.

Commissioner Murillo stated that he does not see justification for reinstalling the meters and resources would be better invested in smart meters in the downtown area.

Commissioner Delk stated that he agrees with Commissioners Franklin and Murillo. He further stated that the companies need to take ownership of parking for their employees.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet stated that companies in the area are required to provide free parking to their employees and that WeWork, located in the Manhattan Towers, was not complying. Discussion followed about WeWork subleasing and failure to provide the required parking for employees.

Commissioner Delk stated that permit parking seemed like a good option. **Commissioner Murillo** concurred.

Commissioner Longhurst stated that he sees no problem with installing meters if the city decides to monetize a portion of the street. **Commissioner Longhurst** called for motion.

MOTION: It was moved and seconded (**Franklin/Delk**) to support staff recommendations #1, #3, and #4 with no changes as outlined in the staff report and to deny recommendation #2.

AYES: Murillo, Franklin, and Delk

NOES: Longhurst

ABSTAIN: None

ABSENT: Paralusz

09/26/19-5 Consideration of New Single-Space and Multi-Space Parking Infrastructure

Utilities Division Manager, Shawn Igoe summarized the staff report about parking meter upgrades. A supplemental PowerPoint presentation was provided as a visual aid. The city currently has 1,808 single-space parking meters operating on the 2G network. A parking meter pilot study was recently conducted using 58 single-space parking meters to be equipped with new technology; 4G cellular chips, vehicle occupancy detection and near-field communication (NFC). Staff would like to recommend that the single space parking meters be replaced to include the upgraded technology.

Shawn Igoe stated that staff is recommending the Metlox Parking Lot be converted to a multi-space parking system. This would reduce the amount of single-space parking meters by 450 spaces with the installation of 12 multi-space kiosks. Because the current single-space meters operate on solar panels, the parking meter batteries located in the Metlox Parking Lot need to be changed out regularly due to lack of sunlight. **Shawn Igoe** stated that the initial conversion cost would be about \$115,000. As part of the conversion, space availability signs would be placed at entrances. It was further stated that there are other options for payment, which included tickets being produced to be placed on dashboards, pay-by-spot with assigned numbered parking, and pay-by-license plate, which would require a license plate reader.

Commissioner Murillo asked how the revenue of parking meters compared to the revenue generated by tickets and which collected more money. **Shawn Igoe** responded that he did not have an answer for the question.

Commissioner Murillo asked where the Downtown Manhattan Beach Business and Professional Association (DBPA) stands on this item. **Shawn Igoe** responded that this had not been presented to them yet. **Commissioner Murillo** stated that he felt the upgrade could enhance the shopping experience for patrons.

Acting Revenue Services Manager Cynthia Mickschl stated that when discussion for increased parking meter rates were discussed with the DBPA, the technology upgrade for parking meters was also discussed and that a few of the members were behind the idea. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** further stated that the DBPA supported the increase to parking meter rates with the intention that the funds would go towards better technology.

Commissioner Franklin felt that this needed to be directly asked to the businesses. He further stated that the technology could be confusing and cause unnecessary back-ups at the kiosks. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** stated that a “pay and display” style parking trial run had been conducted in 2008 at the Pier Parking Lots which resulted in a long line of people waiting at the kiosks. There need to be enough kiosks for it to work. **Shawn Igoe** stated that other cities are using the multi-space systems successfully. **Commissioner Franklin** reiterated that the businesses need to be brought into the conversation. He asked the number of transactions done in the trial. **Shawn Igoe** responded that he did not know the answer.

Discussion followed on the viability of the multi-space parking system and various technologies. Commissioners gave their concerns about “Big Brother” issues with this particular technology and what type of meters should be recommended.

Commissioner Delk stated that he was in favor of putting the new meters in but withholding some of options such as “zeroing the meters”.

Chairperson Longhurst stated he was also in favor of the parking meter upgrades. He suggested some options concerning the Metlox garage such as controlled entry access. He also suggested hardwiring the current Metlox single-space meters to address the solar panel issue. **Shawn Igoe** responded that hardwiring the meters would be expensive.

Chairperson Longhurst called for a motion.

MOTION: It was moved and seconded (**Murillo/Franklin**) to support the replacement of single space parking meters throughout the city.

AYES: Murillo, Franklin, Delk, and Chair Longhurst
NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None
ABSENT: Paralusz

MOTION: It was moved and seconded (**Murillo/Delk**) to continue to investigate the best options for the Metlox underground parking meters, and to include the Downtown Manhattan Beach Businesses and Professional Association and the Police Department.

AYES: Murillo, Franklin, Delk, and Chair Longhurst
NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None
ABSENT: Paralusz

G. OTHER ITEMS

09/26/19-6. Monthly Revenue and Expenditure Reports: Receive and File
Received and filed.

09/26/19-7. Staff Updates

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet stated that the Skechers project is moving forward and that the south deck of the mall is moving upward. He further stated that the old Macy’s Men’s area is planned to be subdivided into three tenants with a possible office component on the second floor. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** stated that one future agenda item is the revision of the City parking rates for different land uses.

Commissioner Franklin asked for a contact person for the mall project concerning a left-turn coming out to Village Drive. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** suggested the general manager for the mall or contractor’s design team.

Commissioner Franklin commended Traffic Engineer Zandvliet on handling 17th Street school drop-off issue. **Traffic Engineer Zandvliet** stated it was a team effort with Public Works and the Police Department.

09/26/19-8. Commissioner Items

There were no Commissioner Items.

H. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at **8:45p.m.** to the regular Parking and Public Improvements Commission Meeting on October 24, 2019 at 6:00p.m. in the City Council Chambers at 1400 Highland Avenue, in said City.

/s/Scott Longhurst
SCOTT LONGHURST
Chairperson

/s/Fel Cortez
FEL CORTEZ
Recording Secretary

ATTEST:

/s/Erik Zandvliet
ERIK ZANDVLIET
Traffic Engineer