

City of Manhattan Beach

*1400 Highland Avenue
Manhattan Beach, CA 90266*



Meeting Minutes - Draft

Tuesday, May 20, 2025

6:00 PM

Regular Meeting

City Council Chambers and Zoom

City Council Regular Meeting

ELECTED OFFICIALS

Mayor Amy Thomas Howorth

Mayor Pro Tem David Lesser

Councilmember Joe Franklin

Councilmember Nina Trieu Tarnay

Councilmember Steve S. Charelian

PLEASE NOTE THAT THE CITY ARCHIVES THE VIDEO RECORDINGS OF ALL REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETINGS AND THE VIDEO FOR THIS MEETING IS HEREBY INCORPORATED BY THIS REFERENCE. ALSO IN SUPPORT OF MORE TRANSPARENCY AND THE AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT (ADA) COMPLIANCE, THE CITY OFFERS CLOSED CAPTIONING FOR REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETINGS. FOR A COMPLETE RECORD OF THIS CITY COUNCIL MEETING, GO TO:

www.manhattanbeach.gov/departments/city-clerk/city-council-meetings-agendas-and-minutes

A. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

Mayor Howorth called the meeting to order.

B. PLEDGE TO THE FLAG

Grayson Cravatt of Pacific Elementary School led the Pledge of Allegiance.

C. ROLL CALL

Roll Call led by Assistant City Clerk Martha Alvarez.

Present: 5 - Mayor Howorth, Mayor Pro Tem Lesser, Councilmember Franklin, Councilmember Tarnay and Councilmember Charelian

D. CEREMONIAL CALENDAR

1. Presentation of a Certificate of Recognition to Maia Rocha from Mira Costa High School for Being One of Thirty High School Seniors to be Awarded a \$50,000 STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering, and Math) Scholarship from Southern California Edison with Plans to Attend University of Southern California (USC), While Pursuing the Human Technology Interaction Joint Major Across the Viterbi School of Engineering and the Iovine and Young Academy. [25-0222](#)

PRESENT

On behalf of the City Council, Mayor Howorth presented a Certificate of Recognition to Maia Rocha from Mira Costa High School for being one of thirty high school seniors to be awarded a \$50,000 STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering, Math) Scholarship from Southern California Edison with plans to attend University of Southern California (USC), while pursuing the Human Technology Interaction Joint Major across the Viterbi School of Engineering and the Iovine and Young Academy.

2. Presentation of a Certificate of Recognition to Pacific Elementary School for Receiving the Prestigious California Distinguished School Award and a Certificate of Recognition to Ms. Elizabeth Madison Hutchinson from Mira Costa High School for Being Named Teacher of the Year. [25-0223](#)

PRESENT

On behalf of the City Council, Mayor Howorth presented a Certificate of Recognition to Pacific Elementary School for receiving the Prestigious California Distinguished School Award and a Certificate of Recognition to Ms. Elizabeth Madison Hutchinson of Mira Costa High School for being named Teacher of the Year.

3. Presentation of a Certificate of Recognition to the Manhattan Beach Roundhouse Aquarium for the Dolphin Project. [25-0224](#)

PRESENT

On behalf of the City Council, Mayor Howorth presented a Certificate of Recognition to the Manhattan Beach Roundhouse Aquarium for the Dolphin Project and accepted a gift (photograph of bottlenose dolphins outside the Roundhouse Aquarium) from the Manhattan Beach Roundhouse Aquarium.

E. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND WAIVER OF FULL READING OF ORDINANCES

City Attorney Quinn Barrow provided that Public Hearing Item No. 17 will be continued to a future City Council meeting at the request of the applicant.

A motion was made by Councilmember Tarnay, seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Lesser, to pull Public Hearing Item No.17 to be continued to a future City Council meeting at the request of the applicant and waive full reading of ordinances. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

A motion was made by Mayor Pro Tem Lesser, seconded by Mayor Howorth, to reconsider the approval of the agenda. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

A motion was made by Councilmember Tarnay, seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Lesser, to pull Public Hearing Item No.17 to be continued to a future City Council meeting at the request of the applicant; to pull Agenda Item No. 6 to be heard under Section I - Items Removed From the Consent Calendar; and waive full reading of ordinances. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

F. CITY COUNCIL AND COMMUNITY ORGANIZATION ANNOUNCEMENTS OF UPCOMING EVENTS (1 MINUTE PER PERSON)

Cultural Arts Commissioner Suzanne Karger announced that a map of the sculptural artworks in Manhattan Beach is now available to the community; the map includes a QR code that provides the history and details of each piece; and copies can be found at the Manhattan Beach Art Center and on the City's website under the Parks and Recreation Department, Cultural Arts section.

Interim Community Development Director Michael Codron invited the community to a meeting to discuss potential interim uses of the site at 400 Manhattan Beach Boulevard, to be discussed at Project Pulse at the Manhattan Heights Park Community Center on May 21, 2025, at 6:00 PM.

Waste Management (WM) Recycling Education Representative Bobby Bell reminded the community that, in observance of Memorial Day on Monday, May 26, 2025, all waste collection services will be delayed by one day; and gave a shout-out in recognition of Public Works Week, expressing gratitude to the Public Works Department and Public Works Director Erick Lee for their continued support and strong partnership with Waste Management (WM).

Library Manager Josh Murray invited the community to celebrate the 10th anniversary of the Manhattan Beach Library with a special performance by extraordinary juggler Michael Drainer on Tuesday, June 3, 2025, from 11:00 AM to 12:00 PM; and reminded the community that the library will be closed on Monday, May 26, 2025, in observance of Memorial Day.

Leadership Manhattan Beach High School Seniors Isabel L., Bryce N., and Lucas S. provided an update on their ongoing work with DaVinci Rise, an organization dedicated to delivering quality education to underserved and underprivileged students. This year's project centered on developing a Makerspace Cart to offer students a creative and hands-on learning environment.

Leadership Manhattan Beach Class of 2000 representative Liz Laffoon invited the community to a special event, the Millennium Time Capsule Retrieval Ceremony, taking place at Veterans Parkway, across from the Joslyn Community Center on June 28, 2025, at 2:00 PM.

Police Chief Rachel Johnson invited the community to the Annual Mark Vasquez Memorial Event Blood Drive at the Joslyn Community Center on May 22, 2025, from 9:00 AM - 8:00 PM.

Mayor Howorth announced that she attended the Manhattan Beach Library Speaker Series event featuring Chef Roy Choi, noting it was a wonderful community gathering.

G. PUBLIC COMMENTS (3 MINUTES PER PERSON)

Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments. The following individual(s) spoke:

*Ray Joseph
Richard Montgomery
Kim Wetherby
Michael Zislis
Dennis Fitzgerald*

Seeing no further requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.

H. CONSENT CALENDAR (APPROVE)

A motion was made by Councilmember Tarnay, seconded by Councilmember Franklin, to approve the Consent Calendar with Agenda Item No.6 being removed to be heard under Section I - Items Removed From the Consent Calendar. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

4. City Council Minutes: [25-0177](#)

This Item Contains Minutes of the Following City Council Meeting(s):

- a) City Council Adjourned Regular Meeting Minutes of April 30, 2025
- b) City Council Adjourned Regular Meeting Minutes of May 6, 2025
- c) City Council Regular Meeting Minutes of May 6, 2025

(No Budget Impact) (City Clerk Tamura).

APPROVE

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

5. Financial Report: [25-0190](#)

- a) Schedule of Demands: April 2025
- b) Investment Portfolio Report: March 2025
- c) Month End Financial Reports: March 2025

(No Budget Impact) (Acting Finance Director Bretthauer).

ACCEPT REPORT AND DEMANDS

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

6. Consideration of a Revision to the City Council Assignments to Include [25-0230](#)

the 2026 FIFA World Cup and the 2028 Summer Olympics Subcommittee with the Appointment of Mayor Howorth and Councilmember Tarnay to the Subcommittee (No Budget Impact) (City Clerk Tamura).

APPROVE

This item was removed from the Consent Calendar and heard under Section I - Items Removed from the Consent Calendar.

7. Consideration of a Resolution Granting the Roundhouse Aquarium a [25-0242](#)

Special One-Time Permit to Allow Alcoholic Beverage Use on Public Property (No Budget Impact) (City Manager Mirzakhian and Police Chief Johnson).

ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-0054

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

8. Consideration of Approval of the Fiscal Year 2025-2026 City Council Work Plan (No Budget Impact) (City Manager Mirzakhonian). [25-0126](#)
APPROVE

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

9. Consideration of a Public Safety Camera System Policy (No Budget Impact) (City Manager Mirzakhonian) [25-0007](#)
RECEIVE AND FILE

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

10. Consideration of a Resolution Approving an Agreement with Harris & Associates for Direct Assessment Services with a Maximum Compensation of \$40,000 Annually for Five Years (Budgeted) (Acting Finance Director Bretthauer). [25-0216](#)
ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-0047

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

11. Consideration of a Resolution Approving the Assessment Engineer's Report for Annual Levy of Street Lighting Assessments for Fiscal Year 2025-2026 and a Resolution Declaring the City Council's Intention to Provide for the Annual Levy and Collection of Assessments, and Setting the Public Hearing to Consider the Assessments for June 17, 2025 (Budgeted) (Acting Finance Director Bretthauer). [25-0148](#)
A) ADOPT RESOLUTION NOS. 25-0044 AND 25-0045
B) SET PUBLIC HEARING DATE FOR JUNE 17, 2025

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

12. Consideration of a Resolution Approving Amendment No. 2 to the Professional Services Agreement with Pacific Harbor Medical Group, Inc. to Provide Professional Medical Services at a Cost Not-to-Exceed \$274,000 through June 30, 2027 (Budgeted) (Human Resources Director Jenkins). [25-0212](#)
ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-0048

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

13. Consideration of a Resolution Approving Amendment No. 2 to the Professional Services Agreement with the Law Offices of Angel Ho, Inc. to Conduct Independent Investigations of Confidential Matters at a Cost Not-to-Exceed \$300,000 (Budgeted) (Human Resources Director Jenkins). [25-0213](#)
ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-0049

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

14. Consideration of Accepting as Complete Work Performed by Gentry General Engineering, Inc. for the Manhattan Village Senior Villas Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) Pathway Project (No Budget Impact) (Public Works Director Lee). [25-0096](#)

A) ACCEPT

B) AUTHORIZE

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

15. Lot 3 Parking Structure Local Emergency Update (Unbudgeted) (Public Works Director Lee). [25-0139](#)

DETERMINE THAT THERE IS A NEED TO CONTINUE THE EMERGENCY ACTION

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

I. ITEMS REMOVED FROM THE CONSENT CALENDAR

6. Consideration of a Revision to the City Council Assignments to Include the 2026 FIFA World Cup and the 2028 Summer Olympics Subcommittee with the Appointment of Mayor Howorth and Councilmember Tarnay to the Subcommittee (No Budget Impact) (City Clerk Tamura). [25-0230](#)

APPROVE

Councilmember Franklin provided that he pulled the item to give City Council an opportunity to either reconsider the subcommittees composition or proceed thoughtfully, given that the City currently lacks available venues or parks, and wanted to ensure the two newly elected Councilmembers have a chance to serve on the subcommittee.

Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments.

Seeing no requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.

City Manager Talyn Mirzakhanian responded to City Council questions.

A motion was made by Mayor Pro Tem Lesser, seconded by Councilmember Tarnay, to approve the revision to the City Council Assignments to include the 2026 FIFA World Cup and the 2028 Summer Olympics Subcommittee; and appointed Mayor Howorth as delegate and Councilmember Tarnay as alternate to the subcommittees. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

J. PUBLIC HEARINGS

16. Conduct Public Hearing to Consider Adopting New Refuse Rates for Residential and Commercial Solid Waste Collection Services, Effective July 1, 2025, Through June 30, 2030 (Potential Budget Impact) (Public Works Lee). [25-0161](#)

(Estimated Time: 30 Mins.)

A) CONDUCT PUBLIC HEARING**B) ANNOUNCE PROTESTS****C) ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-0050**

Public Works Director Erick Lee introduced Solid Waste Administrator Anna Luke-Jones who provided the PowerPoint presentation.

Solid Waste Administrator Luke-Jones responded to City Council questions.

Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments.

Seeing no requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.

Assistant City Clerk Martha Alvarez announced that, as of 7:25 PM, the City Clerk's Office had received a total of 93 protest letters.

Solid Waste Administrator Luke-Jones and Waste Management (WM) Recycling Education Representative Bobby Bell responded to City Council questions.

A motion was made by Mayor Howorth, seconded by Councilmember Franklin, to adopt Resolution No. 25-0050, a resolution of the Manhattan Beach City Council adopting residential and commercial refuse collection rates and the City cost recovery fee for the period of July 1, 2025, through June 30, 2030. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

At 7:31 PM, the City Council recessed and reconvened at 7:41 PM with all City Councilmembers present.

17. Conduct a Hearing to Consider: Approval of a Nuisance Abatement Cost Report; and a Determination that the Costs of Abatement Constitute a Special Assessment Against the Property Located at 1467 11th Street or Shall be a Lien on the Property for the Amount of the Assessment (City Attorney Barrow). [25-0247](#)
(Estimated Time: 15 Mins.)
ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-0053

Mayor Howorth reminded the public that Item No. 17 was continued to a future City Council meeting at the request of the property owner.

K. GENERAL BUSINESS

18. Consideration of an Annual Funding Request from Marine Mammal Care Center Los Angeles in the Amount of \$50,000 for Operational Support (Not Budgeted) (Interim Community Development Director Codron). [25-0208](#)
(Estimated Time: 30 Mins.)
A) RECEIVE REPORT
B) DISCUSS AND PROVIDE DIRECTION

Interim Community Development Director Michael Codron introduced Environmental Programs Administrator Britny Coker-Moen who provided the PowerPoint presentation.

Marine Mammal Care Center Chief Operations and Education Officer Dave Bader continued with the PowerPoint presentation.

Environmental Programs Administrator Coker-Moen, Marine Mammal Care Center Chief Operations and Education Officer Bader, City Manager Talyn Mirzakhaniah and City Attorney Quinn Barrow responded to City Council questions.

Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments.

Seeing no requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.

City Attorney Barrow and City Manager Mirzakhaniah responded to City Council questions.

A motion was made by Councilmember Tarnay, seconded by Mayor Howorth, to direct staff to include \$50,000 in support of the request as part of a one-year agreement, with the option to extend for two additional years; to explore alternative funding sources; and, if none are identified, to proceed with General Fund support, with a request to receive a report from Marine Mammal Care Center throughout the year. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

19. Consideration of a Resolution Approving a Memorandum of Understanding with the LoveMB Foundation (LoveMB) to Identify, Evaluate, and Fundraise for Programs, Facilities, and Projects that Enhance the Quality of Life of the Residents and Community of the City of Manhattan Beach; Consideration of Four Fundraising Projects; and Appointment of a Councilmember to Serve as the City Council Delegate to the LoveMB Board (No Budget Impact) (Parks and Recreation Director Leyman).

[25-0207](#)

(Estimated Time: 45 Mins.)

A) ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-0051

B) APPROVE

C) APPOINT

Parks and Recreation Director Mark Leyman provided the PowerPoint presentation.

Parks and Recreation Director Leyman, City Manager Talyn Mirzakhanian, Public Works Director Erick Lee and City Attorney Quinn Barrow responded to City Council questions.

Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments.

Seeing no requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.

City Manager Mirzakhanian and Public Works Director Lee responded to City Council questions.

A motion was made by Mayor Howorth, seconded by Councilmember Tarnay, to adopt Resolution No. 25-0051, a resolution of the Manhattan Beach City Council approving an agreement between the City of Manhattan Beach and the LoveMB Foundation regarding fundraising for programs, facilities, and projects that enhance the quality of life of the residents and community of the City of Manhattan Beach. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

A motion was made by Mayor Howorth, seconded by Councilmember Tarnay, to direct staff to proceed with the four fundraising projects outlined in the staff report. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

A motion was made by Mayor Howorth, seconded by Councilmember Charelian, to appoint Councilmember Frankin as delegate and Councilmember Tarnay as alternate, to serve on the LoveMB Board. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

20. Presentation of the Proposed Five-Year Capital Improvement Program (CIP) for Fiscal Year 2025-2026 through Fiscal Year 2029-2030 (Public Works Director Lee). [25-0228](#)

(Estimated Time: 30 Mins.)

A) DISCUSS AND PROVIDE DIRECTION

B) APPROVE

Public Works Director Erick Lee introduced Acting City Engineer Gil Gamboa who provided the PowerPoint presentation.

Acting City Engineer Gamboa and Public Works Director Lee responded to City Council questions.

Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments.

Seeing no requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.

City Attorney Quinn Barrow, Acting Finance Director Libby Bretthauer and City Manager Talyn Mirzakhian responded to City Council questions.

The City Council directed staff to revise the plan to ensure a minimum of \$1,500,000 in annual reserves for the CIP Fund, accelerate the City Hall Employee Lounge renovation project by two years, and consider including a project to replace the railings in the Pier Parking Lots.

21. Presentation of the Fiscal Year 2026 Proposed Operating Budget [25-0227](#)
(Acting Finance Director Bretthauer).

(Estimated Time: 1 Hr.)

DISCUSS AND PROVIDE DIRECTION

Acting Finance Director Libby Bretthauer provided background regarding the item and provided the PowerPoint presentation.

Acting Finance Director Bretthauer, City Attorney Quinn Barrow, City Manager Talyn Mirzakhian and Public Works Director Erick Lee responded to City Council questions.

Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments.

Seeing no requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.

Acting Finance Director Bretthauer and City Manager Mirzakhian responded to City Council questions.

The City Council directed staff to provide the redline version of the Financial Policies document, as well as a comparative analysis outlining the advantages and disadvantages of dedicating General Fund Revenues to capital projects versus implementing policy transfers.

L. CITY COUNCIL REQUESTS AND REPORTS INCLUDING AB 1234 REPORTS

22. City Council AB 1234 Reports. [25-0231](#)
RECEIVE AND FILE

None.

23. Consideration of a Request by Mayor Pro Tem Lesser and Mayor Howorth to Discuss Potential Safety Measures on Sepulveda Boulevard [25-0234](#)
(City Manager Mirzakhian).

DISCUSS AND PROVIDE DIRECTION

Councilmember Tarnay provided that she would be the third vote in order to have the item return on a future agenda.

The City Council directed staff to provide a comprehensive report on potential safety measures on Sepulveda Boulevard.

24. Consideration of a Request by Councilmember Tarnay and Councilmember Charelian to Discuss Implementing a Phased Approach for the Previously Approved Commercial Parking Permit Rates, Associated Fiscal Impacts, and the Formula Used to Determine the Oversubscription of the Permits (City Manager Mirzakhonian). [25-0235](#)
DISCUSS AND PROVIDE DIRECTION

Mayor Howorth provided that she would be the third vote in order to have the item return on a future agenda.

The City Council directed staff to provide a comprehensive report on implementing a phased approach for the previously approved commercial parking permit rates, associated fiscal impacts, and the formula used to determine the oversubscription of the permits.

25. Consideration of a Request by Councilmember Charelian and Mayor Howorth to Explore Opportunities to Assist the Owner of the Previously Approved Commercial (Hotel and Retail/Office) Project at 600 South Sepulveda Boulevard (City Manager Mirzakhonian). [25-0236](#)
DISCUSS AND PROVIDE DIRECTION

Councilmember Franklin provided that he would be the third vote in order to have the item return on a future agenda.

City Manager Talyn Mirzakhonian responded to City Council questions.

The City Council directed staff to provide a comprehensive report to explore opportunities to assist the owner of the previously approved commercial (hotel and retail/office) project at 600 South Sepulveda Boulevard.

26. Consideration of a Request by Councilmember Franklin and Councilmember Tarnay to Discuss the South Coast Air Quality Management District's Residential Electric Lawn and Garden Rebate Program (City Manager Mirzakhonian). [25-0237](#)
DISCUSS AND PROVIDE DIRECTION

Councilmember Charelian provided that he would be the third vote in order to have the item return on a future agenda.

The City Council directed staff to provide a comprehensive report regarding the South Coast Air Quality Management District's Residential Electric Lawn and Garden Rebate Program.

M. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Mayor Howorth requested to agendize a discussion on funding options for the Manhattan Beach Roundhouse Aquarium. Councilmember Tarnay concurred.

N. CITY MANAGER REPORT

None.

O. CITY ATTORNEY REPORT

None.

P. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

**27. Agenda Forecast (City Clerk Tamura).
INFORMATION ITEM ONLY**

[25-0225](#)

This item was received and filed by order of the Chair.

Q. CLOSED SESSION

None.

R. ADJOURNMENT

*At 10:41 PM, Mayor Howorth adjourned the meeting to the June 3, 2025,
Adjourned Regular City Council Meeting at 5:00 PM.*

Breana Contreras
Recording Secretary

Amy Thomas Howorth
Mayor

ATTEST:

Liza Tamura
City Clerk