

# City of Manhattan Beach

1400 Highland Avenue  
Manhattan Beach, CA 90266



## Meeting Minutes - Draft

Tuesday, May 6, 2025

6:00 PM

Regular Meeting

City Council Chambers and Zoom

## City Council Regular Meeting

### ***ELECTED OFFICIALS***

***Mayor Amy Thomas Howorth***

***Mayor Pro Tem David Lesser***

***Councilmember Joe Franklin***

***Councilmember Nina Trieu Tarnay***

***Councilmember Steve S. Charelian***

PLEASE NOTE THAT THE CITY ARCHIVES THE VIDEO RECORDINGS OF ALL REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETINGS AND THE VIDEO FOR THIS MEETING IS HEREBY INCORPORATED BY THIS REFERENCE. ALSO IN SUPPORT OF MORE TRANSPARENCY AND THE AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT (ADA) COMPLIANCE, THE CITY OFFERS CLOSED CAPTIONING FOR REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETINGS. FOR A COMPLETE RECORD OF THIS CITY COUNCIL MEETING, GO TO:

[www.manhattanbeach.gov/departments/city-clerk/city-council-meetings-agendas-and-minutes](http://www.manhattanbeach.gov/departments/city-clerk/city-council-meetings-agendas-and-minutes)

**A. CALL MEETING TO ORDER**

*Mayor Howorth called the meeting to order.*

**B. PLEDGE TO THE FLAG**

*Walker Overholt of Grandview Elementary School led the Pledge of Allegiance.*

**C. ROLL CALL**

*Roll Call led by City Clerk Liza Tamura.*

**Present:** 5 - Mayor Howorth, Mayor Pro Tem Lesser, Councilmember Franklin, Councilmember Tarnay and Councilmember Charelian

**D. CEREMONIAL CALENDAR**

1. Presentation of a Proclamation to the Beach Cities Health District Declaring May, 2025 as Mental Health Awareness Month and Accepting a Proclamation from the Beach Cities Health District Regarding Mental Health Awareness (No Budget Impact) (City Clerk Tamura). [25-0210](#)

**A) PROCLAIM**

**B) ACCEPT**

*On behalf of the City Council, Mayor Howorth presented a Proclamation to the Beach Cities Health District proclaiming May 2025 as Mental Health Awareness Month and accept a Proclamation from the Beach Cities Health District regarding Mental Health Awareness.*

2. Certificates of Recognition to Cyndi Strand and the Blankets of Love South Bay Volunteers on Their Milestone of Donating 5,000 Blankets to Various Beneficiaries (Richstone Family Center, Casa de los Angelitos, Shelter Partnership, Good + Foundation, Los Angeles County Department of Children and Family Services, and Baby2Baby) (No Budget Impact) (City Clerk Tamura).

[25-0193](#)

**PRESENT**

*On behalf of the City Council, Mayor Howorth presented Certificates of Recognition to Cyndi Strand and the following Blankets of Love South Bay volunteers on their milestone of donating 5,000 blankets to various beneficiaries.*

Founder

*Cyndi Strand*

Volunteers

*Laura Barbato  
Julie Bisceglia  
Paula Brissette  
Suzy Cawthon  
Cathy Churchwell  
Nancy Cook  
Suzie Deshmukh  
Rosalynd Divinity  
Marsha Ensminger  
Anne Garrett  
Linda Glaza  
Elli Horne  
Rhonda Ingelman  
Linda Ivey  
Cristina Kabealo  
Karen LaBelle  
Carole Leff  
Jackie Loper  
Judy Mann  
Penny Mason  
Marcie Matika  
Andrea Miller  
Catherine Nall  
Barbara Ravetti  
Sylvia Rayner  
Amy Roberts  
Lorna Ross  
Janice Rudolph  
Mimi Rump  
Muriel Savikas  
Carole Schoendienst*

*Joyce Stepanek*  
*Kari Walker*  
*Linda West*  
*Alice Williams*  
*Maria Wohlmuth*  
*Lynn Zeman*  
*Janet Zimmerman*

3. Presentation of Certificates of Recognition to Local AYSO Teams for Placing in the Soccer Western States Championship (No Budget Impact) (City Clerk Tamura).

[25-0192](#)

**PRESENT**

*On behalf of the City Council, Mayor Howorth presented Certificates of Recognition to the following AYSO Teams for Placing in the Soccer Western States Championship:*

*AYSO 12UG - Lunatics Team*

*Winners of Region 18 Beach Cup 1st Place,  
Area 1D Tournament of Champions 2nd Place and  
Section 1 League Championship 1st Place*

*12UG Lunatics*

*Maya Karim  
Alexis Lemieux  
Ava Luedeke  
Ella Melendez  
Skylar Osuna  
Lucy Reichle  
Mia Reichle  
Skylar Reiss  
Marlo Talbott  
Willow Young*

*Coaches*

*Assistant Coach Ron Melendez  
Assistant Coach Adam Reiss  
Head Coach Chris Talbott*

*AYSO 14UG - Blue Fire Team*

*Winners of Region 18 Beach Cup 1st Place,  
Area 1D Tournament of Champions 1st Place, and  
Section 1 League Championship 1st Place*

*AYSO 14UG - Blue Fire*

*Brinley Andrews  
Matilda Buchanan  
Bella Feldman  
Lennon Fortmann  
Stella Freelin  
Sienna Kadera  
Shayne Massey  
Makaila Reese  
Charlize Rico  
Eloise Rumminger  
Rose Walsh*

*Audrey West  
Phoebe Wuebben*

*Coaches*

*Assistant Coach Collin West  
Head Coach Patrick Wuebben*

*AYSO 12UG - All Star Venom Team*

*Winners of Area 1D All Star Tournament 1st Place and  
Section 1 All Star Championship 2nd Place*

*12UG Venom*

*Talar Adishian  
Candace Christensen  
Charlotte Gilleland  
Ellie Helou  
Ellora Kottoor  
Madison Kratz  
Skylar Loder  
Mia McCoy  
Elise Myers  
Peyton Myers  
Marlo Talbott  
Justine Time Wolfgramm*

*Coaches*

*Assistant Coach Jim Kottoor  
Head Coach Chris Talbott*

*AYSO 12UB - All Star Mambas Team*

*Winners of Area 1D All Star Tournament 1st Place and  
Section 1 All Star Championship 1st Place*

*12UB Mambas*

*Kai Billett  
Noah Dax  
Connor Deery  
Connor DeFalco  
Levi Eyer  
Andrew Fach  
George La Bella  
Sammy Lasko  
Jack Mosier  
Lukas Pasula  
Fidel Sanchez  
Beau Venning*

*Coaches*

*Assistant Coach James DeFalco*

*Head Coach James Mosier*

*AYSO 14UG - All Star MB Black Team*

*Winners of Area 1D All Star Tournament 1st Place and  
Section 1 All Star Championship 1st Place*

*14UG MB Black*

*Quincy D'Andrea*

*Simone Dozier*

*Miri Flosse*

*Axi Herbert*

*Emily Keane*

*Darcey Larcombe*

*Candace Lee*

*Madison Loder*

*Ellie Mathes*

*Keira McCracken*

*Gianna Sawalich*

*Ava Shay*

*Lauren Tran*

*Charlotte Young*

*Coaches*

*Assistant Coach Blair Herbert*

*Head Coach Chris Mathew O'Neill*

*AYSO 14UB - All Star KSA Team*

*Winners of Area 1D All Star Tournament 1st Place and  
Section 1 All Star Championship 1st Place*

*14UB KSA*

*Braden Balik*

*Jackson Billett*

*Tyler Buxton*

*Colton Cantrell*

*Gage Harris*

*Brody Kakuk*

*Lucas Kraines*

*Marco Olson*

*Blake Paddock*

*Silas Rizkalla*

*Tyler Sotsky*

*Jaxton Vann*

*Valentino Vizia*

*Owen Werhane*

*Coaches*

*Assistant Coach Andrew Werhane*

*Head Coach Tim Harris*

**E. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND WAIVER OF FULL READING OF ORDINANCES**

A motion was made by Mayor Pro Tem Lesser, seconded by Councilmember Franklin, to pull Agenda Item No. 6 to be heard under Section I - Items Removed From the Consent Calendar and waive full reading of ordinances. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

**Nay:** 0



**F. CITY COUNCIL AND COMMUNITY ORGANIZATION ANNOUNCEMENTS OF UPCOMING EVENTS (1 MINUTE PER PERSON)**

*On behalf of the City Council, Mayor Howorth expressed profound sadness over the tragic death of Braun Levi and extended heartfelt condolences to his family, friends, and the Loyola High School community. She acknowledged the public's concerns about safety on Sepulveda Boulevard and reaffirmed the City's commitment to making necessary improvements to protect the community. The City's Traffic Engineer stated he has been urgently engaging with Caltrans, and the City is now working with Senator Ben Allen to escalate these concerns and pursue all available resources to enhance safety. A moment of silence was held in Braun Levi's honor.*

*Planning Manager Adam Finestone provided an update on the City's acquisition of the new property at 400 Manhattan Beach Boulevard, which will be used for parking and other public-serving purposes in the downtown area. He also invited the community to a meeting to discuss potential interim uses of the site, to be discussed at Project Pulse at the Manhattan Heights Park Community Center on May 21, 2025, at 6:00 PM.*

*Waste Management (WM) Recycling Education Representative Bobby Bell provided an update on last week's free paper shredding event held at Mira Costa High School, as well as the first composting class at Polliwog Park, noting that the instructor had a great experience. He also announced a new partnership with American Martyrs School, which has joined the Zero Waste Lunch Program, and shared that students are enthusiastically participating.*

*Acting Finance Director Libby Bretthauer informed the community that one of the Finance Department's top priorities this year is to enhance financial transparency. She highlighted two recent efforts supporting this goal: the release of the City's Popular Annual Financial Report and the launch of a new Open Transparency portal on the City's website, which provides accessible information on City revenues and expenditures.*

*Library Manager Josh Murray invited the community to participate in three upcoming sessions of the "Toddler and Me Yoga" series, taking place on Wednesdays, May 7, 14, and 21, 2025, from 10:15 AM to 10:45 AM.*

*Library Commissioner Diane Levitt announced the 10th anniversary of the Manhattan Beach Public Library building and announced a special celebration featuring a talk with Chef Roy Choi at Mira Costa High School on May 17, 2025.*

*Leadership Manhattan Beach Class of 2000 representative Liz Laffoon invited the community to a special event, the Millennium Time Capsule Retrieval Ceremony, taking place at Veterans Parkway, across from the Joslyn Community Center on June 28, 2025, at 2:00 PM.*

**G. PUBLIC COMMENTS (3 MINUTES PER PERSON)**

*Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments. The following individual(s) spoke:*

*Mary Montes  
Nazly Westernoff  
Tanya Monaghan  
Tara Hackley  
Jan Holtze  
Larry Zimbalist*

*Seeing no further requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.*

*Councilmember Tarnay acknowledged the public's concerns regarding safety on Sepulveda Boulevard and reaffirmed that the City Council, along with the Police Department, Fire Department, and neighboring cities, is actively working toward solutions. She emphasized that the City is engaging with Caltrans to elevate these concerns and pursue all available resources to improve safety as quickly as possible.*

**H. CONSENT CALENDAR (APPROVE)**

A motion was made by Mayor Pro Tem Lesser, seconded by Councilmember Franklin, to approve the Consent Calendar with Agenda Item No.6 being removed to be heard under Section I - Items Removed From the Consent Calendar. The motion carried by the following vote:

**Aye:** 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

**Nay:** 0

**4. City Council Minutes:**[25-0176](#)

This Item Contains Minutes of the Following City Council Meeting(s):

- a) City Council Adjourned Regular Meeting Minutes (City Council Governance Workshop) of February 10, 2025
- b) City Council Adjourned Regular Meeting Minutes of April 14, 2025
- c) City Council Regular Meeting Minutes of April 15, 2025
- d) City Council Adjourned Regular Meeting Minutes (Boards and Commissions Interviews) of April 22, 2025
- e) City Council Adjourned Regular Meeting Minutes (State of the City) of April 29, 2025 (City Clerk Tamura).

**APPROVE**

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

**5. Declaration of Proclamations for the Following:**[25-0195](#)

- a) May 4, 2025, as International Firefighters' Day
- b) May 15, 2025, as National Peace Officers Memorial Day
- c) May 4-10, 2025, as Professional Municipal Clerks Week
- d) May 4-10, 2025, as Public Service Recognition Week
- e) May 4-10, 2025, as National Correctional Officers Week
- f) May 11-17, 2025, as National Police Week
- g) May 18-24, 2025, as National Public Works Week
- h) May 2025, as Asian American and Pacific Islander Heritage Month
- i) May 2025, as Building Safety Month
- j) May 2025, as Jewish American Heritage Month
- k) May 2025, as National Bicycle Safety Month
- l) May 2025, as Older Americans Month

**PROCLAIM**

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

6. Consideration of a Resolution Approving Amendment No. 2 to the Professional Services Agreement with waterTALENT, LLC to Extend the Term Through June 30, 2027, and Provide Specialty Technical Temporary Staffing Services at a cost Not-To-Exceed \$650,000 (No Budget Impact) (Human Resources Director Jenkins). [25-0132](#)  
**ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-0027**

This item was removed from the Consent Calendar and heard under Section I - Items Removed from the Consent Calendar.

7. Consideration of a Purchase of One Budgeted Replacement Fire Engine from South Coast Fire Equipment in the Amount of \$1,593,170 (Budgeted) (Interim Fire Chief Lang). [25-0204](#)  
**A) WAIVE FORMAL BIDDING DUE TO COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT**  
**B) AUTHORIZE PURCHASE**

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

8. Lot 3 Parking Structure Local Emergency Update (Unbudgeted) (Public Works Director Lee). [25-0158](#)  
**DETERMINE THAT THERE IS A NEED TO CONTINUE THE EMERGENCY ACTION**

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

---

**I. ITEMS REMOVED FROM THE CONSENT CALENDAR**

- 6.** Consideration of a Resolution Approving Amendment No. 2 to the Professional Services Agreement with waterTALENT, LLC to Extend the Term Through June 30, 2027, and Provide Specialty Technical Temporary Staffing Services at a cost Not-To-Exceed \$650,000 (No Budget Impact) (Human Resources Director Jenkins). [25-0132](#)
- ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-0027**

*Councilmember Charelian provided he pulled the item to allow staff an opportunity to confirm details and provide additional information.*

*Public Works Director Erick Lee provided background regarding the item and responded to City Council questions.*

*Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments.*

*Seeing no requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.*

**A motion was made by Councilmember Charelian, seconded by Councilmember Tarnay, to adopt Resolution No. 25-0027, a resolution of the Manhattan Beach City Council approving Amendment No. 2 to an agreement between the City of Manhattan Beach and waterTALENT, LLC for providing specialty technical temporary staffing services to the water division. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

**Nay:** 0

**J. PUBLIC HEARINGS**

*None.*

**K. GENERAL BUSINESS**

9. 2025 Annual Appointments to Boards and Commissions (No Budget Impact) (City Clerk Tamura).

[25-0201](#)

(Estimated Time: 45 Mins.)

**APPOINT**

*City Clerk Liza Tamura introduced Deputy City Clerk Breana Contreras who provided a brief background regarding the item and responded to City Council questions.*

*Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments.*

*Seeing no requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.*

*Deputy City Clerk Contreras conducted the annual Boards and Commissions appointment process.*

*The following appointments were unanimously made:*

*Parks and Recreation Commission*

*Seat No. 1 (Member-At-Large): Russ Allen (reappointed)*

*Seat No. 6 (Member-At-Large): Tracey Windes (reappointed)*

*Seat No. 7 (Student Representative): Ishaan Aggarwal*

*Cultural Arts Commission*

*Seat No. 2 (Member-At-Large): Suzanne Karger (reappointed)*

*Seat No. 4 (Member-At-Large): Ellen Rosenberg*

*Seat No. 6 (Student Representative): Alex Dickey*

*Library Commission*

*Seat No. 1 (Member-At-Large): Rita Crabtree-Kampe*

*Seat No. 2 (Member-At-Large): Diane Levitt (reappointed)*

*Seat No. 6 (Student Representative): Kylie Cullen*

*City Clerk Tamura, Parks and Recreation Director Mark Leyman, and City Attorney Quinn Barrow responded to City Council questions.*

*City Council directed staff to return to City Council with an urgency ordinance, an ordinance, and all necessary resolutions to amend commission membership, including the addition of a member-at-large seat to both the Cultural Arts Commission and Library Commission, as well as the appointment of a student representative alternate to the Parks and Recreation Commission, Cultural Arts Commission, and Library Commission.*

*At 7:58 PM, the City Council recessed and reconvened at 8:12 PM with all City Councilmembers present.*

10. Presentation of the Fiscal Year 2026 Proposed Operating Budget  
(Acting Finance Director Bretthauer).

[25-0067](#)

(Estimated Time: 45 Mins.)

**DISCUSS AND PROVIDE DIRECTION**

*Acting Finance Director Libby Bretthauer provided the PowerPoint presentation, and responded to City Council questions.*

*Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments. The following individual(s) spoke:*

*Stefan Kampe*

*Jim Burton*

*Jill Lamkin*

*Seeing no further requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.*

*Following additional questions and comments from the City Council, along with responses from staff, Mayor Howorth informed the public that a Budget Study Session will be held on Tuesday, May 13, 2025, at 6:00 PM.*

11. Consideration of a Resolution Approving a Pass-Through Increase for Cost Recovery Related to Wholesale Water Purchases and Discussion of the Need for an Updated Water Rate Study, Sewer Rate Study, and Financial Plan (Budgeted Fiscal Year 2026) (Public Works Director Lee). [25-0117](#)

(Estimated Time: 30 Mins.)

**A) ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-0046**

**B) DISCUSS AND PROVIDE DIRECTION**

*Public Works Director Erick Lee introduced Utilities Manager Jeff Page who provided the PowerPoint presentation.*

*Utilities Manager Page and Public Works Director Lee responded to City Council questions.*

*Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments. The following individual(s) spoke:*

*Stefan Kampe*

*Jim Burton*

*Diane Wallace*

*Jill Lamkin*

*Seeing no further requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.*

*Public Works Director Lee responded to City Council questions.*

**A motion was made by Mayor Howorth, seconded by Councilmember Tarnay, to adopt Resolution No. 25-0046, a resolution of the Manhattan Beach City Council adopting an automatic rate adjustment for Fiscal Year 2025-2026 that passes through increases in wholesale water costs pursuant to government code section 53756 and directed staff to begin the process of updating the City's water and sewer rate studies to align them on the same schedule. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

**Nay:** 0



12. Discuss and Provide Direction to Staff Regarding Interim Uses of the City's Recent Real Property Acquisition Located at 400 Manhattan Beach Boulevard (Minimal Budget Impact) (Interim Community Development Director Codron). [25-0181](#)

(Estimated Time: 15 Mins.)

**DISCUSS AND PROVIDE DIRECTION**

*Interim Community Development Director Michael Codron introduced Associate Planner Tari Kuvhenguhwa who provided the PowerPoint presentation.*

*Associate Planner Kuvhenguhwa and City Manager Talyn Mirzakhaniah responded to City Council questions.*

*Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments. The following individual(s) spoke:*

*Stefan Kampe*

*Jim Burton*

*Seeing no further requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.*

*Acting Finance Director Libby Bretthauer responded to City Council questions.*

**A motion was made by Councilmember Tarnay, seconded by Councilmember Franklin, to direct staff to continue the interim use of the lot for the commercial parking permit program and to proceed with the installation of bicycle racks at the proposed locations, while also exploring additional rack placement with an emphasis on preserving green space where feasible. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Aye:** 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

**Nay:** 0

**L. CITY COUNCIL REQUESTS AND REPORTS INCLUDING AB 1234 REPORTS**

*None.*

**M. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

*Mayor Pro Tem Lesser requested to agendize a discussion on potential safety measures on Sepulveda Boulevard. Mayor Howorth concurred.*

*Acting Finance Director Libby Bretthauer responded to City Council questions.*

*Councilmember Tarnay requested to agendize a discussion on implementing a phased approach for the previously approved commercial parking permit rates, associated fiscal impacts, and the formula used to determine the oversubscription of the permits. Councilmember Charelian concurred.*

*Councilmember Charelian requested to agendize a discussion to explore opportunities to assist the owner of the previously approved commercial (hotel and retail/office) project at 600 South Sepulveda Boulevard forward. Mayor Howorth concurred.*

*Councilmember Franklin requested to agendize a discussion regarding the South Coast Air Quality Management District's Residential Electric Lawn and Garden Rebate Program. Councilmember Tarnay concurred.*

*Mayor Howorth requested to agendize a discussion on establishing a subcommittee for the 2026 FIFA World Cup and 2028 Summer Olympics. Councilmember Tarnay concurred.*

**N. CITY MANAGER REPORT**

*City Manager Talyn Mirzakhani announced that the City Council will go dark for its regularly scheduled meeting on July 1, 2025. City Council concurred.*

**O. CITY ATTORNEY REPORT**

*None.*

**P. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS****13. Agenda Forecast (City Clerk Tamura).  
INFORMATION ITEM ONLY**

[25-0160](#)

*This item was received and filed by order of the Chair.*

**14. Commission Minutes:** [25-0194](#)

This Item Contains Minutes of the following City Commission Meetings:

a) Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of November 27, 2024

(Interim Community Development Director Codron)

b) Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of December 25, 2024

(Interim Community Development Director Codron)

c) Parks and Recreation Commission Meeting Minutes of January 27, 2025

(Parks and Recreation Director Leyman)

d) Parks and Recreation Commission Meeting Minutes of February 24, 2025

(Parks and Recreation Director Leyman)

e) Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of February 26, 2025

(Interim Community Development Director Codron)

f) Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of March 12, 2025

(Interim Community Development Director Codron)

g) Cultural Arts Commission Meeting Minutes of March 17, 2025

(Parks and Recreation Director Leyman)

h) Parks and Recreation Commission Meeting Minutes of March 24, 2025

(Parks and Recreation Director Leyman)

i) Planning Commission Meeting Minutes of March 26, 2025

(Interim Community Development Director Codron)

j) Parking and Public Improvements Commission Meeting Minutes of March 27, 2025 (Interim Community Development Director Codron).

**INFORMATION ITEM ONLY**

*This item was received and filed by order of the Chair.*

**15. Recent Planning Commission Quasi-Judicial Decisions: Consideration** [25-0219](#)

of a Use Permit to Allow the Operation of a Food and Beverage Sales Use with Off-Sale of Beer and Wine, in Conjunction with an Ancillary Eating and Drinking Establishment Use with On-Sale Beer and Wine Located at 1121 Artesia Boulevard (The Butchery) (Interim Community Development Director Codron).

**INFORMATION ITEM ONLY**

*This item was received and filed by order of the Chair.*

**Q. CLOSED SESSION**

*None.*

**R. ADJOURNMENT**

*At 10:28 PM, Mayor Howorth adjourned the meeting to the May 13, 2025,  
Adjourned Regular City Council Meeting at 4:00 PM.*

---

**Breana Contreras**  
**Recording Secretary**

---

**Amy Thomas Howorth**  
**Mayor**

**ATTEST:**

---

**Liza Tamura**  
**City Clerk**