

City of Manhattan Beach

1400 Highland Avenue
Manhattan Beach, CA 90266



Meeting Minutes - Draft

Tuesday, April 15, 2025

6:00 PM

Regular Meeting

City Council Chambers and Zoom

City Council Regular Meeting

ELECTED OFFICIALS

Mayor Amy Thomas Howorth

Mayor Pro Tem David Lesser

Councilmember Joe Franklin

Councilmember Nina Trieu Tarnay

Councilmember Steve S. Charelian

PLEASE NOTE THAT THE CITY ARCHIVES THE VIDEO RECORDINGS OF ALL REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETINGS AND THE VIDEO FOR THIS MEETING IS HEREBY INCORPORATED BY THIS REFERENCE. ALSO IN SUPPORT OF MORE TRANSPARENCY AND THE AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT (ADA) COMPLIANCE, THE CITY OFFERS CLOSED CAPTIONING FOR REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETINGS. FOR A COMPLETE RECORD OF THIS CITY COUNCIL MEETING, GO TO:

www.manhattanbeach.gov/departments/city-clerk/city-council-meetings-agendas-and-minutes

A. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

Mayor Howorth called the meeting to order.

B. PLEDGE TO THE FLAG

Audrey Judson led the Pledge of Allegiance.

C. ROLL CALL

Roll Call led by City Clerk Liza Tamura.

Present: 5 - Mayor Howorth, Mayor Pro Tem Lesser, Councilmember Franklin, Councilmember Tarnay and Councilmember Charelian

D. CEREMONIAL CALENDAR

1. Presentation of Certificates of Recognition to Alicia Fei, Evan Lee, Marcus Mann, Elara Onat, and Sophia Zandpour for Receiving the 2025 Circle Award for Excellence in Poetry Sponsored by the Parks and Recreation Department's Older Adults Program.

[25-0172](#)

PRESENT

On behalf of the City Council, Mayor Howorth and Bob Perkins of the Poetry Circle, presented Certificates of Recognition to the following recipients of the 2025 Circle Award for Excellence in Poetry, sponsored by the Parks and Recreation Department's Older Adults Program.

Recipients:

Alicia Fei

Evan Lee

Marcus Mann

Elara Onat

Sophia Zandpour

2. Presentation of Certificates of Recognition to the Outdoor Dining Task Force Members for their Participation as a Member and Alternate.

[25-0179](#)

PRESENT

On behalf of the City Council, Mayor Howorth presented Certificates of Recognition to the following Outdoor Dining Task Force Members for their participation as a member and alternate.

Planning Commissioners

Joseph Ungoco, Member

Kristin Sistos, Alternate

Parking and Public Improvements Commissioner

Bob DaGiau, Member

Downtown Business and Professional Association (DBPA)

Jill Lamkin, Member

Chamber of Commerce

Maureen McBride, Member

Downtown Residents

Jim Burton, Member

Carol Perrin, Alternate

North Manhattan Beach Business Improvement District (NMBBID)

Mike Simms, Member

North Manhattan Beach Residents

Kimberlee Kelly, Member

Michael Cohen, Alternate

Commercial (MVSC)

Don Ziss, Member

Sher Willis, Alternate

Commercial (Non-MVSC)

Harout Ashikian, Member

At-Large Residents

Paul Mullin, Member

Bridgette Goodman, Member

Brenda O'Leary, Alternate

Loretta Raftery, Alternate

At-Large Resident/Business

Faith Lyons, Member

Peir Serota, Member

*Audrey Judson, Member
Rachel Vandenberg, Alternate
Gerry Morton, Alternate
George Wright, Alternate*

E. APPROVAL OF AGENDA AND WAIVER OF FULL READING OF ORDINANCES

A motion was made by Councilmember Franklin, seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Lesser, to pull Agenda Item No. 8 to be considered at a future City Council meeting and waive full reading of ordinances. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

F. CITY COUNCIL AND COMMUNITY ORGANIZATION ANNOUNCEMENTS OF UPCOMING EVENTS (1 MINUTE PER PERSON)

Library Manager Josh Murray invited adults of the community to attend the upcoming program, "Turning Ideas Into Words," featuring editor and writing coach Jazmin Bozwell, on April 22, 2025, from 6:00 PM to 7:15 PM.

Cultural Arts Supervisor Randy Niessen invited the community to attend the opening reception of "Let Me Fix You a Plate" at the Manhattan Beach Art Center on April 18, 2025, from 5:00 PM to 7:00 PM.

Manhattan Beach Chamber of Commerce Board Member Jill Lamkin invited the community to attend the "State of the City" event, taking place in O'Donnell Hall at American Martyrs Church on April 29, 2025, from 5:00 PM to 6:30 PM. A mixer reception hosted by the Chamber will follow from 6:30 PM to 7:30 PM, and registration is required.

Waste Management (WM) Recycling Education Representative Bobby Bell reminded the community about the upcoming Free Paper Shredding event at Mira Costa on April 26, 2025, and announced the "Compost Made Easy" class, which will be held at Polliwog Park's Manhattan Beach Botanical Garden on May 3, 2025, from 10:00 AM to 12:00 PM.

Police Chief Rachel Johnson invited the community to attend the "Tip-A-Cop" event at Rock'N Fish on April 30, 2025, from 5:00 PM to 8:00 PM; reminded the community to stay safe, enjoy Spring Break responsibly encouraging safe e-bike riding, keeping dogs leashed unless in designated dog parks, and driving cautiously while following the rules of the road; and responded to City Council questions.

G. PUBLIC COMMENTS (3 MINUTES PER PERSON)

Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments. The following individual(s) spoke:

Justin Zapata

Ray Lawson

German Soria

Maureen McBride

Stephen D'Amico

Kelly Oelschlager

Steve Packwood

Seeing no further requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.

H. CONSENT CALENDAR (APPROVE)

A motion was made by Mayor Pro Tem Lesser, seconded by Councilmember Franklin, to approve the Consent Calendar with Agenda Item No. 8 being removed to be considered at a future City Council meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

3. City Council Minutes: 25-0150

This Item Contains Minutes of the Following City Council Meeting(s):

- a) City Council Adjourned Regular Meeting Minutes of March 31, 2025
- b) City Council Adjourned Regular Meeting Minutes of April 1, 2025
- c) City Council Regular Meeting Minutes of April 1, 2025

(City Clerk Tamura).

APPROVE

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

4. Financial Report: [25-0169](#)

- a) Schedule of Demands: March 2025
 - b) Investment Portfolio Report: February 2025
 - c) Month End Financial Reports: February 2025
- (No Budget Impact) (Acting Finance Director Bretthauer).

ACCEPT REPORT AND DEMANDS

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

5. Declaration of a Proclamation Declaring April 2025, as National Poetry Month. [25-0178](#)**PROCLAIM**

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

6. Consideration of Approving a Comprehensive Citywide Salary Schedule for All City Positions and Adjustments to Salary Ranges (No Budget Impact) (Human Resources Director Jenkins). [25-0167](#)

(No Budget Impact) (Human Resources Director Jenkins).

ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-0037

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

7. Consideration of Second Reading and Adoption of an Ordinance, [25-0165](#)
Amending Chapter 2.37 (Public Projects) of the Manhattan Beach
Municipal Code to Remove the Online Bid and Proposal Service Fee for
Capital Projects and Public Construction Projects (No Budget Impact)
(Public Works Director Lee).
ADOPT ORDINANCE NO. 25-0003

The recommendation for this item was approved on the Consent Calendar.

8. Consideration of a Resolution Approving a Three-Year Maintenance [25-0025](#)
Services Agreement with West Coast Arborists for Tree Management
Services in an Amount Not-to-Exceed \$3,102,425 (No Budget Impact)
(Public Works Director Lee).
ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-0038

This item was removed from the Consent Calendar and will be continued to be
considered at a future City Council meeting, per City Council consensus.

I. ITEMS REMOVED FROM THE CONSENT CALENDAR

8. Consideration of a Resolution Approving a Three-Year Maintenance [25-0025](#)
Services Agreement with West Coast Arborists for Tree Management
Services in an Amount Not-to-Exceed \$3,102,425 (No Budget Impact)
(Public Works Director Lee).
ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-0038

*Mayor Howorth reminded everyone that Item No. 8 from the Consent
Calendar will be continued and considered at a future City Council meeting,
per City Council consensus.*

J. PUBLIC HEARINGS

9. Conduct a Public Hearing for Consideration of Adopting a Resolution Regarding the Citywide User Fee Schedule and Cost Allocation Plan (Unbudgeted) (Acting Finance Director Bretthauer). [25-0055](#)
(Estimated Time: 45 Min.)

A) CONDUCT PUBLIC HEARING**B) ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-0020**

Acting Finance Director Libby Bretthauer introduced Budget & Financial Analyst Emy-Rose Hanna who provided the PowerPoint presentation.

Budget & Financial Analyst Hanna introduced Willdan Financial Services Principal Consultant Tony Thrasher who continued with the PowerPoint presentation for the Finance Department.

Willdan Financial Services Principal Consultant Thrasher and Acting Finance Director Bretthauer responded to City Council questions.

Willdan Financial Services Principal Consultant Thrasher continued with the PowerPoint presentation for the Parks and Recreation Department.

Willdan Financial Services Principal Consultant Thrasher, Senior Management Analyst Linda Robb and Parks and Recreation Director Mark Leyman responded to City Council questions.

Willdan Financial Services Principal Consultant Thrasher continued with the PowerPoint presentation for the Management Services Department - City Clerk.

City Clerk Liza Tamura responded to City Council questions.

Willdan Financial Services Principal Consultant Thrasher continued with the PowerPoint presentation for Citywide.

Willdan Financial Services Principal Consultant Thrasher, Acting Finance Director Bretthauer, Senior Management Analyst Patty Matson and City Attorney Quinn Barrow responded to City Council questions.

Willdan Financial Services Principal Consultant Thrasher continued with the PowerPoint presentation for the Police Department.

Willdan Financial Services Principal Consultant Thrasher and Police Chief Rachel Johnson responded to City Council questions.

Willdan Financial Services Principal Consultant Thrasher continued with the PowerPoint presentation for the Fire and Public Works Department.

Public Works Director Erick Lee, Principal Civil Engineer Mike Guerrero, Senior Management Analyst Nicholle Petroff and Willdan Financial Services Principal Consultant Thrasher responded to City Council questions.

Willdan Financial Services Principal Consultant Thrasher continued with the PowerPoint presentation for the Community Development Department.

Willdan Financial Services Principal Consultant Thrasher, Budget & Financial Analyst Hanna, Traffic Engineer Erik Zandvliet, Planning Manager Adam Finestone, Building Official Ryan Heise and Principal Civil Engineer Guerrero responded to City Council questions.

Willdan Financial Services Principal Consultant Thrasher continued with the PowerPoint presentation for New and Eliminated Fees.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet and Building Official Heise responded to City Council questions.

Willdan Financial Services Principal Consultant Thrasher and Budget & Financial Analyst Hanna continued with the PowerPoint presentation for Policy Considerations.

Budget & Financial Analyst Hanna responded to City Council questions.

At 8:21 PM, the City Council recessed and reconvened at 8:40 PM with all City Councilmembers present.

Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments. The following individual(s) spoke:

*Steve Packwood
Stefan Kampe
Jim Burton
Jill Lamkin*

Seeing no further requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.

Budget & Financial Analyst Hanna, Traffic Engineer Zandvliet, City Manager Talyn Mirzakhani, Planning Manager Finestone, City Attorney Barrow, Willdan Financial Services Principal Consultant Thrasher and Public Works Director Lee responded to City Council questions.

A motion was made by Councilmember Charelian, seconded by Councilmember Tarnay, to adopt, as amended, Resolution No. 25-0020, a resolution of the Manhattan Beach City Council establishing new fees and charges for goods, services, and facilities provided by the City of Manhattan Beach and amending and restating the City's comprehensive fee schedule. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

10. Conduct a Public Hearing for Consideration of: [25-0144](#)

- a) Coastal Development Permits to Approve an Increase to Parking Meter Rates at On-Street Meters, City Parking Lots and Beach Parking Lots and an Increase to Commercial Parking Permit Rates in the Coastal Zone;
- b) A Resolution to Approve an Increase to On-Street Parking Meter Rates Outside of the Coastal Zone; and
- c) A Resolution to Approve an Increase to Citywide Parking Citation Penalties (Unbudgeted) (Acting Finance Director Bretthauer and Interim Community Development Director Codron).

(Estimated Time: 30 Min.)

A) CONDUCT PUBLIC HEARING**B) ADOPT RESOLUTION NOS. 25-0039, 25-0040, 25-0041, AND 25-0042**

Acting Finance Director Libby Bretthauer provided the PowerPoint presentation.

Following the PowerPoint presentation, the City Council considered extending the meeting beyond 11:00 PM.

City Attorney Quinn Barrow responded to City Council questions.

At 10:20 PM, a motion was made by Mayor Pro Tem Lesser, seconded by Councilmember Charelian, to extend the April 15, 2025, City Council Regular Meeting past 11:00 PM. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

Acting Finance Director Bretthauer, Traffic Engineer Erik Zandvliet, Planning Manager Adam Finestone and City Manager Talyn Mirzakhian responded to City Council questions.

Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments. The following individual(s) spoke:

*Jill Lamkin
Jim Burton*

Seeing no further requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.

Acting Finance Director Bretthauer, Public Works Director Erick Lee and Traffic Engineer Zandvliet responded to City Council questions.

A motion was made by Mayor Howorth, seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Lesser, to adopt Resolution No. 25-0039, a resolution of the Manhattan Beach City Council approving a Coastal Development Permit to allow modifications to the public parking meter rates for on-street spaces and beach public parking lots within the appealable portion of the City's coastal zone; to adopt Resolution No. 25-0040, a resolution of the Manhattan Beach City Council approving a coastal development permit to allow modifications to the commercial parking permit rates and public parking meter rates for on-street spaces and city-owned lots, within the non-appealable portion of the City's coastal zone; to adopt Resolution No. 25-0041, a resolution of the Manhattan Beach City Council increasing parking meter rates outside the coastal zone to \$3.00 per hour; and adopt, as amended, Resolution No. 25-0042, a resolution of the Manhattan Beach City Council approving a \$6.00 increase in parking citation penalties and adjusting the late penalty fee for parking citations. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

K. GENERAL BUSINESS

11. Consideration of a Revision to the City Council Assignments to Include a Library Subcommittee and Appointment of Two City Councilmembers as Delegate and Alternate (No Budget Impact) (City Clerk Tamura). [25-0175](#)
(Estimated Time: 15 Mins.)

A) DISCUSS AND PROVIDE DIRECTION**B) APPOINT**

City Clerk Liza Tamura and City Manager Talyn Mirzakhian responded to City Council questions.

Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments.

Seeing no requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.

A motion was made by Councilmember Tarnay, seconded by Councilmember Charelian, to direct staff to include the reintroduction of the Library Subcommittee in the City Council Assignments and appointed Mayor Pro Tem Lesser as Delegate and Councilmember Franklin as Alternate. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

12. Consideration of a Plan to Transition Parking Payment Infrastructure to Payment Kiosks and Mobile Pay Options (Unbudgeted) (Public Works Director Lee). [25-0106](#)
(Estimated Time: 30 Mins.)

DISCUSS AND PROVIDE DIRECTION

Public Works Director Erick Lee introduced Senior Management Analyst Nicky Petroff who provided the PowerPoint presentation.

Senior Management Analyst Petroff, Traffic Engineer Erik Zandvliet, Public Works Director Lee, City Manager Talyn Mirzakhian and Dixon Resources Unlimited Principal and Director of Operations Peter Macdonald responded to City Council questions.

Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments.

Seeing no requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.

A motion was made by Mayor Howorth, seconded by Councilmember Franklin, to direct staff to consider the plan to transition parking payment infrastructure to payment kiosks and mobile pay options, including the policy of license plate readers. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

13. Lot 3 Parking Structure Local Emergency Update (Unbudgeted) (Public Works Director Lee).

[25-0120](#)

(Estimated Time: 30 Mins.)

- A) **DETERMINE THAT THERE IS A NEED TO CONTINUE THE EMERGENCY ACTION**
- B) **ADOPT RESOLUTION NO. 25-0043 RATIFYING A CONSTRUCTION AGREEMENT WITH CARBON ACTIVATED CORPORATION IN THE AMOUNT OF \$1,160,755 FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF THE INTERIM PARKING LOT**

Public Works Director Erick Lee introduced Principal Civil Engineer Jeff Fijalka who provided the PowerPoint presentation.

Traffic Engineer Erik Zandvliet continued with the PowerPoint presentation.

Principal Civil Engineer Fijalka responded to City Council questions.

Mayor Howorth opened the floor to public comments. The following individual spoke:

Jill Lamkin

Seeing no further requests to speak, Mayor Howorth closed the floor to public comments.

City Manager Talyn Mirzakhian responded to City Council questions.

A motion was made by Councilmember Franklin, seconded by Councilmember Charelian, to determine that there is a need to continue the emergency action of Parking Lot 3. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

A motion was made by Councilmember Franklin, seconded by Councilmember Tarnay, to adopt Resolution No. 25-0043, a resolution of the Manhattan Beach City Council ratifying the approval of plans and specifications and a construction contract between Manhattan Beach and Carbon Activated Corporation to construct an interim parking lot at 1155 Morningside Drive. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Howorth, Lesser, Franklin, Tarnay and Charelian

Nay: 0

L. CITY COUNCIL REQUESTS AND REPORTS INCLUDING AB 1234 REPORTS

- 14.** City Council AB 1234 Reports. [25-0159](#)
RECEIVE AND FILE

Mayor Howorth reported that the Legislative Subcommittee, consisting of herself and Mayor Pro Tem Lesser, met to discuss potential legislative updates that could support the City's planning efforts. Following that meeting, the Subcommittee and City Manager Talyn Mirzakhian met with Senator Ben Allen. Mayor Howorth described it as a productive discussion that may lead to helpful legislative support for the City's planning process, without reducing the number of housing units the City is required to provide.

- 15.** Consideration of a Request by Mayor Pro Tem Lesser and Councilmember Tarnay to Discuss the City's Noticing Policy for Residential Overlay District (ROD) Projects (City Manager Mirzakhian). [25-0182](#)
DISCUSS AND PROVIDE DIRECTION

Mayor Howorth provided that she would be the third vote in order to have the item return on a future agenda.

The City Council directed staff to provide a comprehensive report regarding the City's noticing policy for Residential Overlay District (ROD) projects.

M. FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

None.

N. CITY MANAGER REPORT

None.

O. CITY ATTORNEY REPORT

None.

P. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

- 16.** Agenda Forecast (City Clerk Tamura). [25-0151](#)
INFORMATION ITEM ONLY

This item was received and filed by order of the Chair.

17. Commission Minutes:[25-0152](#)

This Item Contains Minutes of the following City Commission Meetings:

- a) Library Commission Meeting Minutes of August 12, 2024
(Parks and Recreation Director Leyman)
- b) Library Commission Meeting Minutes of September 9, 2024
(Parks and Recreation Director Leyman)
- c) Library Commission Meeting Minutes of November 12, 2024
(Parks and Recreation Director Leyman)
- d) Cultural Arts Commission Meeting Minutes of December 16, 2024
(Parks and Recreation Director Leyman)
- e) Parking and Public Improvements Commission Meeting Minutes of January 23, 2025 (Interim Community Development Director Codron)
- f) Cultural Arts Commission Meeting Minutes of February 19, 2025
(Parks and Recreation Director Leyman)
- g) Finance Subcommittee Action Meeting Minutes of March 6, 2025
(Acting Finance Director Bretthauer)
- h) Library Commission Meeting Minutes of March 10, 2025
(Parks and Recreation Director Leyman).

INFORMATION ITEM ONLY

This item was received and filed by order of the Chair.

Q. CLOSED SESSION

None.

R. ADJOURNMENT

*At midnight, Mayor Howorth adjourned the meeting to the April 22, 2025,
Adjourned Regular City Council Meeting at 4:00 PM.*

Breana Contreras
Recording Secretary

Amy Thomas Howorth
Mayor

ATTEST:

Liza Tamura
City Clerk