

**CITY OF MANHATTAN BEACH
PARKING AND PUBLIC IMPROVEMENTS COMMISSION
DRAFT MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING
April 28, 2016**

**4/28/16-3 Consider Additional Downtown Valet Stations, Revised Valet Hours
and Rates**

Chairman Lipps announced upcoming Earth Day events at Polliwog Park and then a short recess took place.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet summarized the staff report and then explained the process going forward.

In response to a question from Commissioner Delk, Traffic Engineer Zandvliet confirmed the valet cost is currently \$9.00, and the City receives portions that go toward lost meters and insurances.

In response to questions from Commissioners, Traffic Engineer Zandvliet said the proposed valet program cannot start while the coastal appeal is still pending; the new proposal must be complete in order to properly address the appeal. He provided further clarification on the appealable components of the valet program.

Chairman Lipps asked if there was existing research prior to the petition being filed that showed the valet program's effectiveness.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet confirmed figures showed the valet was successful by moving 400 cars in the few days of operation, beginning on July 1st and then shutting down shortly thereafter.

Chairman Lipps asked if employees could have a special rate.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet said there has been discussion internally and an appendix in the Downtown Specific Plan includes looking into parking strategies under a separate study.

Commissioner Fournier asked if the taxi zone on Ocean Drive across from Shellback's was considered as a valet option. The location would avoid traveling on residential streets by utilizing 11th Place/Street instead. He suggested an inlet be created, similar to the one if Location C was approved, and then offer public parking during non-valet hours. He asked if this was a possibility for both Shellback's and The Strand House.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet confirmed that could be an alternative and said the preference from businesses was the north side, but the south location would pose similar concerns. He confirmed that the south portion of Ocean Drive is wider than the north side.

In response to a question from Chairman Lipps, Traffic Engineer Zandvliet explained the reasons why Manhattan Beach Boulevard was not considered as an option.

Chairman Lipps opened Audience Participation.

James Quilliam, 124 12th Street, said his garage faces Center Place where the cars would come down with the proposed valet. He is not in favor of the location and said quality of life would suffer for residents on The Strand and Ocean Drive. He expressed concern over increased traffic, safety hazards for vehicles pulling out of garages, emergency responders driving down narrow streets and pedestrians walking on Manhattan Beach Boulevard. He said Downtown already has four parking lots and does not need to increase valet times or locations.

Cynthia Bond, 124 12th Street, said her unit is on Center Place and opposes the proposed valet. She complained about trash cans causing odors, delivery trucks idling, traffic from bar patrons and excessively narrow streets. She would, however, support a Shellback's location.

Jim Burton, 328 11th Street, agreed with Mr. Quilliam and Ms. Bond in opposing Location C. He said Center Place is extremely narrow and Ocean Drive is often used as a drop-off location for beach events. He would support a Shellback's location.

John Schmitt, 1148 The Strand, said his garage faces Ocean Drive and is commonly referred to as an alley with high speed traffic. He observed an increase in pedestrian traffic where there are no sidewalks, taxi circulation, and loading and unloading activity on Ocean Drive year round. He also noted traffic from trash and delivery trucks, which often cause oncoming cars to pull over. He concluded that valets should be on a main thoroughfare like Manhattan Avenue.

Michael Zislis, downtown business owner, said he does not support proposed Location C, but is in favor of a Shellback's location.

Martha Andreani, third generation of Downtown MB, said parking continues to worsen even with the addition of Metlox and opposed any additional valet parking at any location. She said public parking spaces should not be sacrificed for valet services. The City should be managing the 120 spaces reserved for valet purposes. She opposed the Ocean Drive valet because the street is already over utilized, though Shellback's would be a better option. She observed less use of valet service since people started using Uber and Lift and suggested different valet hours for winter and summer months.

Bill Victor, thanked Commissioners for their public service and identified himself as the appellant. His property is on Ocean Drive and he said the street is often referred to as

the speedway. He said the Bicycle Coalition recently designated Ocean Drive as a special bike path and he frequently observes cyclists not heeding stop signs. He also noted summer camp drop offs take place all the way to 7th Street area. He agreed with Ms. Andreani in that no additional valets are needed. He then distributed a photo taken in front of Fonz's that showed an empty valet. He said beach goers would most likely not spend the money to valet, which suggests limited access to the beach that is not consistent with California Coastal Commission policy. He said the valet would not solve, but cause problems and stressed the importance of providing easy beach access for everyone.

Bob Valentine, resident of more than 40 years and lives near the Pier, agreed with previous concerns for proposed Location C, and said the south location would pose the same concerns, if not more. He explained the south parking lot is larger with twice as many vehicle traffic. He also pointed out the limited visibility for those driving northbound on that portion of Ocean Drive, which would be dangerous considering all the foot traffic.

Jim Grande, 1148 Ocean Drive, is the property directly north of The Strand House and is strongly opposed to the Location C valet. He agreed with all the concerns and added that the adjacent parking lot also causes gridlock. He is not against valet programs, but asked the Commission to consider the negative impact on residents for a service that is not essential. He further added that motorists would not necessarily follow the directional signs and cut through streets where it is convenient.

Nancy Raiche, 1148 The Strand, opposed the valet parking on Ocean Drive and agreed with many of the concerns already voiced. She was impressed with the Commission's approach to a solution, but preferred valet operations to be located at either MB Post, Bank of America or Union Bank.

David LaFevre, restaurant owner and resident, agreed with Mr. Zislis on bringing to other side of Ocean Drive and is also in favor of the location by Pages.

Chairman Lipps closed Audience Participation.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner King mentioned three incidents he that occurred at current valet operations that interrupted business operations, involving blocking valet parking spots and verbal assaults toward valet attendants. He stated that he would not support valet operations at The Strand House or other side of street. He would be in favor of renewing valet operations at the Pages location and discussed potential favorable parking ratios. He also proposed extending the parking meters to three hours, instead of two, after 6:00pm.

Commissioner Nicholson said the road is too narrow by The Strand House for valet operations. Shellback's would be a better alternative but only if there was a compelling need for additional valet services, which he said there is not. He requested staff to look into working with the County to extend the hours at the lower pier lots. He would like to see

employers offering parking subsidies to their employees and would support building dedicated parking lots to accommodate those workers.

Commissioner Fournier agreed that Location C is not appropriate for a valet, and that the Shellback's alternative would need further review or be dropped altogether. He added that parking meters should revert back to 8:00pm enforcement, or three-hour parking, though he was not sure of the fiscal implications. He observed an often empty Metlox parking garage lot after 5:00pm because most visitors prefer to park closer. He favors keeping the existing valet operations less the Strand House location.

Commissioner Delk said he is not convinced the City needs additional valet locations. He supports the Pages site and if there was a compelling need for more valet options, he preferred the Shellback's alternative.

Chairman Lipps said he is not in favor of either Ocean Drive locations, and believes three locations is sufficient including the Pages site.

MOTION: Commissioner King made a motion to recommend the City Council deny the proposed valet location next to Strand House and recommend to approve/renew the Pages location. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Fournier. Discussion followed on how to add employee parking into the motion.

Ayes: Delk, Fournier, Chairman Lipps, Nicholson, King.
Noes: None.
Abstain: None.
Absent: None.

MOTION: Commissioner Nicholson made a motion to also recommend to City Council to incorporate employee parking as a component of the valet parking program. The motion was seconded by Chairman Lipps.

Ayes: Delk, Fournier, Chairman Lipps, Nicholson, King.
Noes: None.
Abstain: None.
Absent: None.

Further discussion followed.

F. OTHER ITEMS

04/28/16-5 Monthly Revenue and Expenditure Reports: Receive and File

Received and Filed.

04/28/16-6 Commissioner Items

None.

04/28/16-7 Staff Follow-Up Items

In response to a question from Commissioner Nicholson, Traffic Engineer Zandvliet provided an update on Gelson's project. Staff is reviewing the submitted application. Once the application is deemed complete then it can be submitted for CEQA review. He expects the item to be presented to Planning Commission by summer.

Commissioner Fournier suggested turning 6th Street into a one-way street to mitigate traffic impacts.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet said that could be a possibility to install access controls, but would most likely be done outside of the Gelson's project.

Traffic Engineer Zandvliet provided an update on the Skechers project.

G. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at **9:58 p.m.** to the regular Parking and Public Improvements Commission Meeting on Thursday, May 26, 2016, in the City Council Chambers of City Hall, 1400 Highland Avenue, in said City.